# **Turnover Intention Among Hospitals' Nurses in** China and Abroad: A Synoptic Review

Arielle Doris Kachie Tetgoum<sup>1</sup>, Lulin Zhou<sup>1</sup>

<sup>1</sup>Centre for Medical Insurance, Hospital Management and Health Policy Research, School of Management <sup>1</sup>Jiangsu University, Zhenjiang, China

Abstract: The current nursing shortage and high job turnover among nurses worldwide are still of great concern for nations because of their impact on the effectiveness and efficiency of the healthcare delivery system and their impact on global health goals. This systematic review was based on 33 scientific articles published between 2016 and 2020 in the core Web of Science database. Among the 33 papers selected, 12 were conducted in China, and 21 were carried out outside China. The purpose was to identify the similarities between the determinant of turnover intention among Chinese nurses and nurses working in healthcare institutions in other countries in the world. For each included study, the country, purpose, methods, and key findings were the relevant aspects considered for the analysis. The results revealed that the factors affecting turnover intention are common in China and other parts of the world. These factors include job satisfaction, organizational commitment, job stress, workload, burnout, management style, demographic characteristics, work environment, and other organizational factors. This research confirms that turnover intention is a global issue that needs to be addressed efficiently to limit the continuous effects on people's health.

Keywords: Turnover intention, turnover factors, nurses, healthcare, China.

#### I. INTRODUCTION

Nurses are the critical staff playing an integral and central role in the human health experience and any healthcare system. The importance of their role is no longer to be demonstrated as they provide frontline services, are there for patients and their loved ones when they need help. Likewise, their critical role puts them in positions where their physical and psychological well-being may greatly influence their service care delivery and their organizations' healthiness and productivity [1].

The current nursing shortage and high job turnover among nurses worldwide are still of great concern for nations because of their impact on the effectiveness and efficiency of the healthcare delivery system. Psychological researches defend the assertion that there is a significant positive relationship between turnover intention and actual turnover [2]. Moreover, turnover intention has been demonstrated to be a significant predictor of turnover behavior [3]. In opposition to the actual turnover, the turnover intention is not always easy to discern. Turnover intention has been defined as the employee's perception of the likelihood of leaving his/her current job [4]. It also refers to the intention a worker has to leave or forfeit his/her present position in an organization [5].

Consequently, the propensity of employees to leave their organization can be determined by measuring their turnover intention. According to the authors of [6], every intention is specific to the behavior of interest. Expressing the likelihood that a worker will withdraw from his/her organization can be simultaneously found under many terms in the literature, such as intention to quit, turnover intent, intent to leave, or turnover intention.

It has been reported that the nursing turnover intention globally oscillates between 4 to 54% [3]. A study among (N = 30, 330) nurses in 10 European countries revealed that 13% of them intended to quit their job [7]. Another research among American and European nurses reported a proportion of 14% and 49% of nurses who had a turnover intention, respectively [8]. Among the 2,250 nurses surveyed in 19 hospitals in Shanghai [9], reported that 50.2% were not only dissatisfied, but 40.4% also had the intention to leave their current job. More research revealed that 30% of American nurses would leave their job in the first year of employment. Similar figures were found in Denmark (32%), New Zealand

(26%), and Taiwan (28%), with the pick during the first three months [10]. In the literature, common factors affecting nurses' intention to leave include lack of satisfaction [9], [11] and organizational commitment [12], workplace incivilities [13], burnout [14], low income, workload, and lack of appropriate support from supervisors, experienced colleagues and leaders [11], [15], [16].

Since nurses' responsibilities to promote and protect individual's health play a tremendous role in improving and achieving global health goals, it has become primordial to understand the variables that influence nurses' retention and intention to leave their jobs. Therefore, this review sought to examine the determinants of high turnover intentions of nurses in hospitals in China and abroad, based on 33 scientific articles from international journals.

#### II. METHODS

This study used a synoptic review method. Although nursing turnover is a relatively old research field with a significant number of papers published on this topic, it remains dynamic and very active since nurses' turnover is still current in almost all countries in the world. Our state of the art has focused more on research published between 2016 and 2020 in the core Web of Science database to capture the most recent development in this field. We used a combination of terms such as "(intention to quit, turnover intent, intent to leave, or turnover intention, departure intention), (healthcare professionals, hospital workers, nurses), (hospitals, healthcare institutions), to guide the search. Eligible articles included observational or descriptive studies focusing on turnover intention among nurses working in hospitals or healthcare facilities. A total of 33 scientific papers were identified for the study, where nurses working in healthcare institutions were the participants. The article's selection focused on work done in China and research carried out outside China. Among the 33 papers selected, 12 were from China and 21 from some other countries in the world, including the USA (3), UK (1), Canada (2), Australia (1), Saudi Arabia (1), Portugal (1), South Korea (5), Philippines (1), Ghana (1), Indonesia (2), Brazil (1) Ethiopia (1), and Netherlands (1). For each included study, the country, purpose, methods, and key findings were the relevant aspects considered in grouping them. Finally, the elements associated with turnover intention in those studies were analyzed and discussed using a narrative approach.

#### III. RESULTS

Among the 33 research articles identified, 23 were cross-sectional, which used structural equation modeling, multiple regression, or multivariate analysis to manage the data. Eight articles were reviews, including analytical and systematic reviews. Only two were longitudinal studies. Most of the studies provide insight into turnover intention and its relation with some organizational factors and other influencing factors. Tables 1 and 2 provide information about the studies that focused on nurses' turnover intent abroad, while Table 3 describes research in China. From the findings of this research, the most common factors associated with nursing turnover include job satisfaction, organizational commitment, job stress, workload, burnout, management style, demographic characteristics, work environment, and other organizational factors.

TABLE I: RECENT RESEARCH ON NURSES' TURNOVER INTENTION FACTORS OUTSIDE CHINA

Study	Country	Purpose	Method	Key finding
Rajamohan, Porock, & Chang (2019)	USA	Understand the relationship between job satisfaction, job stress, quality of care, and turnover in personcentered care settings	Analytical review including 11 papers published between 2000 and 2015	Job satisfaction was positively correlated with the quality of care. Turnover was positively correlated to job-related stress and negatively correlated to the quality of education and job satisfaction.
Brook, Aitken, Webb, MacLaren, & Salmon (2019)	UK	Assess the characteristics of successful policies to curb turnover and promote retention of early-career nurses	Review analyses of 53 studies carefully selected among 11,656 eligible papers.	Turnover can be effectively curbed through policies involving internship or residency programs, mentors, transition to practice programs lasting between 27 to 52 weeks.

Hoff, Carabetta, & Collinson (2019)	USA	Examine turnover, satisfaction, and burnout among nurse practitioners and assistant physicians.	Based on job enrichment theories and job demands, 32 research papers published between 2000 and 2016 were carefully analyzed.	The main findings revealed the lack of robust research design and overemphasis on job satisfaction in turnover research studies.
McDermid, Mannix, & Peters (2020)	Australia	Identify factors that contribute to high turnover rates of nurses working in emergency departments	Electronic online databases were used to collect papers published between 2016 and 2018.  Analyses were conducted using Braun and Clarke's six critical phases of thematic analysis.	This study identified violence and aggressions, work environment, and critical incidents as significant nursing turnover factors.
Falatah & Salem (2018)	Saudi Arabia	Appraise and summarize research literature on nursing turnover in the Saudi-Arabian kingdom.	Eleven papers selected from the Journal of Advanced Nursing, 2005; 52, 546-553 were reviewed according to an integrative method.	The determinants of nursing turnover in Saudi Arabia included satisfaction, demographic factors, management, leadership, and job stress-related factors.
Pedrosa, Sousa, Valentim, & Antunes (2020)	Portugal	Identify factors of organizational culture associated with nursing turnover.	A systematic literature review of papers published between 2014 and 2018. The Joanna Briggs Institute and Registered Nurses Association of Ontario guidelines were used to assessing the selected papers' quality.	Evidence showed that nurses' turnover was significantly affected by individual and organizational factors, including management strategies.

TABLE II: RECENT ORIGINAL, EMPIRICAL RESEARCH ON NURSES' TURNOVER INTENTION FACTORS OUTSIDE CHINA

Study	Country	Purpose	Method	Key finding
Chênevert, Jourdain, & Vandenberghe (2016)	Canada	Examine the combined effects of nurses' professional self-image, perceived high-involvement work practices, and pre-entry expectations on actual and intended turnover.	A longitudinal study with three surveys over three years (n = 160). SEM was used to determine the relationship among the constructs.	High-involvement work practices had an indirect, adverse effect on professional and organizational turnover through turnover intention. Turnover was not affected by professional self-image and pre-entry expectations.
Fernet, Trepanier, Demers, & Austin (2017)	Canada	To examine the core reasons for which newly licensed nurses in Quebec, Canada, engage in their	This cross-sectional study recruited a sample of n = 572 French-Canadian newly licensed nurses, and the hypothesized	Autonomous motivation (i.e., when nurses accomplish their work primarily out of a sense of pleasure and satisfaction or because they endorse the importance or value of their

		profession predict their turnover intentions from their organization and occupation.	model was analyzed using structural equation modeling.	work) negatively predicts the intention to quit the profession and organization target-specific affective commitment. However, controlled motivation (i.e., when nurses accomplish their work mainly because of internal or external pressure) is positively associated with continuance commitment to the occupation and organization.
Labrague et al. (2018)	Philippines	Explore the extent correlation between organizational commitment and nursing turnover in the Philippines.	Cross-sectional study with 200 nurses from 9 rural hospitals.	Nurses were moderately committed to their organizations, and the majority were undecided to leave or not leave their workplace. An inverse relationship was found between organizational commitment and turnover intention.

## TABLE II (CONTINUED)

Study	Country	Purpose	Method	Key finding
Rindu, Lukman, Dasman, Hafizurrahman, & Bachtiar (2020)	Indonesia	"To determine turnover intention and factors behind turnover intentions" among private hospital nurses in Jakarta.	A cross-sectional study involving 97 nurses from which survey data were analyzed using Partial Least Square- Structural Equation Modelling (SEM-PLS technique).	The results revealed a significant negative effect of organizational commitment on nurses' turnover intentions (-0.496). "The higher the nurse's organizational commitment, the lower was the nurse turnover intention. The better nurses' job characteristics, the lower was the nurse turnover intention (-0.213)."
Coudounaris, Akuffo, & Nkulenu (2020)	Ghana	To explore the determinants of turnover intentions and job satisfaction among nurses in Accra, Ghana.	This cross-sectional study used SEM analysis to design and evaluate the model's goodness-of-fit while testing the hypotheses.	"Pay rise, pay structure/administration, and job satisfaction were significantly and negatively related to turnover intentions."
Silva, Nora, & Oliveira (2017)	Brazil	Assess the relationship between burnout syndrome and turnover among nursing staff.	Systematic literature review using the Cochrane research method. Fourteen articles were analyzed, including domestic and international publications.	Burnout was found to be a significant predictor of turnover.
Gebregziabher, Berhanie, Berihu, Belstie, & Teklay (2020)	Ethiopia	To "assess the relationship between job satisfaction and turnover intention	A cross-sectional study design was conducted on a sample of n = 148 nurses and analyzed using	The turnover intention was significantly associated with the level of job satisfaction. Unsatisfied nurses were more likely to intend to quit their job

Vol. 9, Issue 2, pp: (134-147), Month: April - June 2021, Available at: www.researchpublish.com

		among nurses in Axum Comprehensive Specialized Hospital Tigray, Ethiopia."	bivariate logistic regression.	than nurses who reported to be satisfied.
Beak & Kang (2018)	Korea	This study aimed at investigating pediatric nurses' perceptions of end-of-life care and turnover intentions.	This cross-sectional descriptive study used regression analysis on a sample of n = 111 hospital nurses.	From our current standpoint, the main take away of this study is that "the perception of obstacles in end-of-life care was positively correlated with turnover intention."

## TABLE II (CONTINUED)

Study	Country	Purpose	Method	Key finding
Kang, Shin, & Lee (2020)	Korea	To identify the relationship between workplace violence and turnover intention and the mediation effect of resilience on hospital nurses' relationship.	A cross-sectional study, including a sample of n = 237 registered nurses, was analyzed "multiple regression and a simple mediation model applying the PROCESS macro."	There was a significant relationship between workplace violence and turnover intention.
Ki, Ryu, Baek, Huh, & Choi- Kwon (2020)	Korea	To identify and classify shift nurses' health issues and to assess the relationship between these health problems and their turnover intentions.	This cross-sectional study analyzed a sample of n=500 nurses using hierarchical clustering and multiple ordinal logistic regression analyses.	The analyses showed that sleep disturbance, depression, and fatigue significantly increased turnover nurses' intention.
Lee, So, & Ko (2019)	Korea	To identify the relation between ethical dilemma, occupational stress, burnout, and turnover intention, and the factors determining nursing turnover intentions	Cross-sectional study where n = 215 nurses were recruited from two university hospitals in Korea. The data collected through the questionnaire were analyzed using descriptive statistics, t-test, ANOVA, correlation analysis, and multiple regression.	Analyses showed that "the higher the score for occupational stress, ethical dilemma, and burnout, the higher the score for turnover intention" and that "the most important factor influencing turnover intention was burnout."
(Choi & Kim, 2020)	Korea	Discern factors affecting nursing turnover intentions among	Hierarchical multiple regression was performed on data collected from 230	The primary evidence showed that the most significant factor affecting ICNs' turnover

Vol. 9, Issue 2, pp: (134-147), Month: April - June 2021, Available at: www.researchpublish.com

infection control	infection control	intention was job stress.
nurses in Korea,	nurses	
including		
organizational		
culture and job		
stress.		

## TABLE II (CONTINUED)

Study	Country	Purpose	Method	Key finding
Lindley & Cozad (2017)	USA	To examine the relationship between nurse knowledge, work environment, and turnover in perinatal hospice and palliative care organizations.	A multivariate analysis was carried out using the USA national home and hospice 2007 survey data based on the intellectual capital theory.	The results showed that the professional experience of advanced practice nurses was significantly related to turnover. There was no other nurse knowledge nor work environment variables that were associated with nursing turnover.
Dewanto & Wardhani(2018)	Indonesia	To describe nurse turnover patterns at Indonesian private hospitals, its causes, and consequences as perceived by hospital managers.	A survey was conducted to collect primary and secondary data from five private general hospitals in three administrative regions in East Java, Indonesia. The Mann-Whitney test and relative risk analysis were applied to those data.	This study revealed that nursing turnover in these regions is between 12 and 34%. Age, experience in the nursing profession, and marital status significantly predicted the risk of turnover.
Heijden, Peeters, Le Blanc, & Van Breukelen (2018)	Netherlands	"To unravel the relationships between job demands and resources, occupational turnover intention, and occupational turnover."	A longitudinal study conducted among 753 nurses "working in European health care institutions (hospitals, nursing homes, and community/home care)."	"The results supported the hypotheses that job demands are positively related with occupational turnover intention while job resources and experience in the nursing profession are negatively related with occupational turnover intention." There was no evidence supporting the hypothesis that "occupational turnover intention mediates the relationship between job demands and job resources on the one hand, and occupational turnover on the other hand." Finally, experience in the nursing profession had a direct effect on occupational turnover, in addition to the direct effect of occupational turnover intention.

TABLE III: RECENT REVIEWS AND EMPIRICAL RESEARCH ON NURSES' TURNOVER INTENTION **FACTORS IN CHINA** 

Study	Country	Purpose	Method	Key findings
L. Lyu, Li, Li, & Li (2016)	China	Examine nursing turnover research papers in china from 2000 to 2015.	1121 relevant research papers were collected from CNKI and Wangfang and analyzed	The authors found that turnover research in China was not deep enough at the time of their study and needed extra funding to move forward in-depth and quality.
D. Lyu, Ji, Zheng, Yu, & Fan (2019)	China	The study aimed to ascertain the mediating effect of psychological empowerment on nurses' abusive supervision and turnover intention.	A cross-sectional survey comprising 1127 nurses from Harbin who were recruited following a convenience sampling method.	"Psychological empowerment was found to mediate the relationship between abusive supervision and turnover intention (P < 0.01). Turnover intention tends to be stronger and psychological empowerment reduced when nurse managers adopt an abusive leadership style."
Xu, Tao, Huang, Little, & Huang (2020)	China	The aim was to investigate Chinese pediatric nurses' turnover intention, sociodemographic factors, and association with job satisfaction and calling.	The study surveyed 10% of nurses from 50% of the pediatric tertiary hospitals nationwide in China, resulting in a total of n = 547 nurses.	The study revealed that calling was the strongest factor influencing turnover intention, weak calling increasing the risk of turnover intention more than ten times.
Chang et al. (2018)	China- Taiwan	To examine the effect of burnout on outcome expectations, self-efficacy, career interest on nurses' intention to leave their organization.	A cross-sectional design and proportionate stratified sampling study. Structural equation modeling was used to fit and evaluate the proposed framework.	Results showed that career interest was negatively related to the turnover from the organization, which was also related to the intention to quit the profession.
Chen, Guohong, Mengting, Lei, & Tiantian (2018)	China	To assess the level and the determinants of nursing turnover in Jiangsu Province, China.	A cross-sectional study was conducted on a sample of n = 1978 nurses by applying root cause analysis and multiple regression analysis.	Nursing intent to leave was significantly predicted by the nurses' education level, age, years of working, professional title, work environment, and level of involvement in hospital affairs.

## TABLE III (CONTINUED)

Study	Country	Purpose	Method	Key findings
Wan, Li, Zhou, & Shang (2018)	China	The aim was to assess turnover intention among experienced nurses and evaluate the effects of job characteristics, work engagement, and work	This descriptive, cross- sectional study collected the data from n = 778 nurses from seven hospitals in China. Structural equation	The analyses showed that 35.5% of nurses experienced turnover intentions. Work engagement partially mediated the

Vol. 9, Issue 2, pp: (134-147), Month: April - June 2021, Available at: www.researchpublish.com

		environment on turnover intentions.	modeling was employed to test a proposed conceptual model.	relationship between work environment and turnover intention.
Yang, Lv, Zhou, Liu, & Mi (2017)	China	To examine work pressure and associated factors contributing to nursing turnover in Shaanxi province, China	This study used a cross- sectional design and recruited 800 registered nurses from Shaanxi province hospitals. The data were analyzed Chi- square test and multi- factor logistic regression.	The results showed that the nurses' turnover intention was strong/very strong (19%), weak (62%), and very weak (19%). Work pressure was the most prominent factor contributing to nurses' intent to leave their profession.
Qi, Wei, Li, Liu, & Xu(2020)	China	To empirically explore and clarify the relationship between nurses' mistreatment by patients, their job satisfaction, and turnover intention. These relations were mediated by work meaningfulness and emotional dissonance and moderated by the role of hostile attribution bias.	This study employed a three-wave survey data collected from 657 nurses working in three hospitals, two in Jinan and one in Taiyuan, China. A structural equation model was used to fit the theoretical model.	The results showed that "mistreatment by patients had a negative effect on nurses' job satisfaction through work meaningfulness, mistreatment by patients had a positive effect on nurses' turnover intention through emotional dissonance."
Ran et al. (2020)	China	This study's objective was to explore the mediating effect of satisfaction between job burnout and turnover intention among primary healthcare workers in central China.	Structural equation modeling was used to analyze the data from n = 540 healthcare workers. The mediation effect test was carried out by using the bootstrap method.	"Age, education level, monthly income, hire form, and night shift were found significantly correlated with turnover intention, and no difference was found between physicians and nurses."
TABLE III (CON	TINUED)			
W. Liu et al. (2018)	China	To examine the relationship between job satisfaction, workplace violence, burnout, organizational support, and turnover intention, and identify factors associated with turnover intention among Chinese nurses in tertiary hospitals.	A purposive sampling method was used to collect data from August 2016 through January 2017. A total of 1 761 nurses from 9 public tertiary hospitals in 4 provinces located in eastern (Beijing), central (Heilongjiang, Anhui), and western (Shaanxi) regions of China completed the questionnaires	The results showed that "Burnout was positively associated with turnover intention (r=0.444, p<0.001). Workplace violence was positively associated with turnover intention (beta=0.035, p<0.001) in linear regression analysis. The total effect (beta=0.53) of workplace violence on turnover intention comprised its direct effect (beta=0.36) and its indirect effect (beta=0.17)."

Vol. 9, Issue 2, pp: (134-147), Month: April - June 2021, Available at: www.researchpublish.com

Haipeng Wang et al. (2020)	China	To examine the relationships between job satisfaction, burnout, and turnover intention, and explore the predictors of turnover intention to retain the primary care providers in rural China.	Using the multistage collection sampling technique, a cross-sectional survey was conducted in Shandong province, China. 1148 primary care providers from 47 rural hospitals participated in this research. Pearson correlation as well as structural equation modeling, and multivariate logistic regression were to analyze the data.	The results showed that "About 14.06% of the respondents had high turnover intention. There was a significant direct effect of job satisfaction on burnout (gamma = -0.52) and turnover intention (gamma = -0.29), a significant direct effect of burnout on turnover intention (gamma = 0.28), and a significant indirect effect (gamma = -0.14) of job satisfaction on turnover intention through burnout as a mediator."
Wan et al. (2018)	China	To explore hospital nursing care workers' turnover intentions and related factors and present some suggestions to improve their retention rate.	A total of 514 HNCWs employed at 11 hospitals in Shanghai participated in this study.	The overall turnover intention of the healthcare workers was 41.3%. Influencing factors included education management satisfaction, satisfaction with wages, satisfaction with their work, work stress, enjoyment of the job, and hours of sleep.

### IV. DISCUSSION

This section considers the common factors that have been identified as influencing nurses' turnover. Given the critical role nurses play in people's health conditions, considerable attention must be given to those prevailing factors threatening their retention.

#### A. Job satisfaction and organizational commitment

While it has been shown that a myriad of relations and mediating effects can exist among variables related to turnover intention, recent research continues to stress the significant importance of job satisfaction in nurses' intent to leave their profession [17], [21], [23-27]. Besides, empirical studies have demonstrated that job satisfaction is a more significant predictor of nursing turnover intent than other predictors such as career advancement, working evening shift, and age. Some works found the effect of heavy workload and quality leadership on turnover intentions to be mediated by professional satisfaction [28].

Employees' satisfaction and commitment influence their quality of care service and determine their decision to continue or discontinue their job with their organizations [23–25], [29–31]. Moreover, it is demonstrated that employees whose needs are met at the workplace and who enjoy their jobs and are highly satisfied with them are more likely to show positive behaviors, perform well, and have higher retention rates [32], [33]. Knowing that low job satisfaction leads to nurses' inconsistent quality health services, high turnover rate, and low patient satisfaction, it is essential to find effective strategies to increase nurses' retention and overcome nurses' persistent shortage.

#### B. Organization factors

In addition to job satisfaction, recent works have also examined the effects of organizational practice settings on nurses' turnover intention. A few works have highlighted the importance of the physical and psychosocial work environment [25], [34]. Other studies also acknowledged the role of organizational policies in curving nurses' intention to quit or

Vol. 9, Issue 2, pp: (134-147), Month: April - June 2021, Available at: www.researchpublish.com

turnover [18], [21], [22], [29], [35]. Healthcare organizations promoting mutual support, friendliness, and warmth among employees have been less likely to be hit with high turnover rates because of the organizational climate.

#### C. Job stress, workload, and burnout

The effects of job stress [17], [21], [23], [36], [37], workload [38–40], and burnout [24], [34], [36], [41], [42] on turnover intention continue to be widely investigated. Even though researches have shown that excessive workload is a significant factor of nursing turnover intention, this does not necessarily lead to actual turnover. Unless other undesirable conditions coexist with allied health, staff was less likely to leave. Excessive work demands and lack of support have been reported to cause nurses deteriorated mental and emotional health. The resulting burnout and stress lead to greater turnover intentions.

#### D. The management style

Management style, communication, and attitude are frequently mentioned as factors that influence nurses' satisfaction and retention [27], [43]. Various positive qualities have been identified as contributing to the perception of a good nursing manager, such as listening to staff and responding to their needs, a supportive attitude, presence within the ward, and the ability to resolve issues [44], [45]. Research findings continue to emphasize the importance of management in creating a positive work climate. Turnover trends and anticipated staff nurse turnover have been correlated with leadership style [21], [35]. Some works have suggested that turnover intention is influenced more by administrators and supervisors than coworkers. Therefore, nursing managers need to understand what is valued the most by their nurses [30].

#### E. Demographic factors

Demographic factors refer to personal characteristics, including gender, age, marital status, income, and educational qualifications. A study in Western Virginia, USA, showed that job satisfaction significantly correlated with attitude, structure, and context variables, although there was no correlation between job satisfaction and age. Studies have shown a significant positive relationship between marital status and job satisfaction [46].

An inverse relationship was found between a high level of educational qualification and turnover intentions [31]. Studies indicated that younger nurses with lower professional positions, less work experience, and lower job titles experienced lower levels of emotional fatigue that are positively related to turnover intentions and negatively associated with job satisfaction [31], [39], [47–50]. However, this observation is mitigated, as other researchers believe that nurses with more experience had the lowest burnout, highest job satisfaction, and were less likely to quit their organization [51]. Worker's age and gender were also shown to influence professional turnover intention [28].

#### F. Work environment and patients

A safe and also pleasing work environment makes workers feel happy being there. Few works highlighted the negative effect of the work environment, such as violence, aggression, and other incidents on nurses' turnover intention [20], [23], [31], [34], [52]. The mistreatment by patients and the perception of obstacles in end-of-life care by nurses have also been reported as factors influencing their turnover intention [53], [54]. Every worker is respected and also given the security that provides the inspiration and motivation to stay. Favorable perceptions of office relationships (manager and coemployees sustain) might help reduce occupational stress, increase job fulfillment and motivation, improve dedication, efficiency, and decrease turnover intentions [55]. Workers like to be current about what happens in the company day after day. Professional motivation and enthusiasm are nurtured when leaders open to them and discuss organizational policies, agreements, and goals. Being open concerning everything related to the organization will undoubtedly help develop trust and encourage employees' participation.

#### V. CONCLUSION

This synoptic review work analyzed the influencing factors of turnover intention among nurses working in health institutions. Because the work was done from a Chinese perspective, studies carried out in China and abroad have been grouped separately. The results revealed that the factors affecting turnover intention in China are not that different from the other part of the world. These findings confirm that nursing turnover is a worldwide issue that needs to be addressed efficiently to reduce its adverse effects and promote prosperous global health.

Vol. 9, Issue 2, pp: (134-147), Month: April - June 2021, Available at: www.researchpublish.com

#### REFERENCES

- [1] Najimi, A. M. Goudarzi, and G. Sharifirad, "Causes of job stress in nurses: A cross-sectional study," Iranian journal of nursing and midwifery research, vol. 17, no. 4, p. 301, 2012.
- [2] J. Burns, "Leadership," 1978.
- [3] M. Flinkman, H. Leino-Kilpi, and S. Salanterä, "Nurses' intention to leave the profession: integrative review," Journal of Advanced Nursing, vol. 66, no. 7, pp. 1422–1434, 2010.
- [4] L. Tao, H. Guo, S. Liu, and J. Li, "Work stress and job satisfaction of community health nurses in Southwest China," Biomedical Research, vol. 29, no. 3, pp. 510–518, 2018.
- [5] R. P. Tett and J. P. Meyer, "Job satisfaction, organizational commitment, turnover intention, and turnover: Path analyses based on meta-analytic findings," Personnel Psychology, vol. 46, no. 2, pp. 259-293, 1993.
- [6] M. M. Alam and J. F. Mohammad, "Level of job satisfaction and intent to leave among Malaysian nurses," Intelligence Journal, vol. 3, no. 1, pp. 123–137, 2010.
- [7] D. Camerino, M. Estryn-Behar, P. Conway, B. Van Der Heijden, and H. Hasselhorn, "Work-related factors and violence among nursing staff in the European NEXT study: a longitudinal cohort study," International Journal of Nursing Studies, vol. 45, no. 11, pp. 1645–1659, 2008.
- [8] L. H. Aiken, W. Sermeus, K. Van den Heede, D. M. Sloane, R. Busse, M. McKee, L. Bruyneel, A. M. Rafferty, P. Griffiths, M. T. Moreno-Casbas, and others, "Patient safety, satisfaction, and quality of hospital care: cross sectional surveys of nurses and patients in 12 countries in Europe and the United States," Bmj, vol. 344, p. e1717, 2012.
- [9] Liu, L. Zhang, W. Ye, J. Zhu, J. Cao, X. Lu, and F. Li, "Job satisfaction and intention to leave: a questionnaire survey of hospital nurses in Shanghai of China," Journal of clinical nursing, vol. 21, no. 1–2, pp. 255–263, 2012.
- [10] (International Council of Nurses) ICN, "International Council of Nurses Workforce Forum," Nursing Workforce Profile Database Summary, 2015.
- [11] J. Liu, B. Zhu, J. Wu, and Y. Mao, "Job satisfaction, work stress, and turnover intentions among rural health workers: a cross-sectional study in 11 western provinces of China," BMC family practice, vol. 20, no. 1, p. 9, 2019.
- [12] S.-S. Han, J.-W. Han, Y.-S. An, and S.-H. Lim, "Effects of role stress on nurses' turnover intentions: The mediating effects of organizational commitment and burnout," Japan Journal of Nursing Science, vol. 12, pp. 287–296, 2015.
- [13] V. A. Lambert, C. E. Lambert, M. Petrini, X. M. Li, and Y. J. Zhang, "Predictors of physical and mental health in hospital nurses within the People's Republic of China," International Nursing Review, vol. 54, no. 1, pp. 85-91, 2007.
- [14] L.-F. Zhang, L.-M. You, K. Liu, J. Zheng, J.-B. Fang, M.-M. Lu, A.-L. Lv, W.-G. Ma, J. Wang, S.-H. Wang, and others, "The association of Chinese hospital work environment with nurse burnout, job satisfaction, and intention to leave," Nursing outlook, vol. 62, no. 2, pp. 128–137, 2014.
- [15] X. Wu, J. Li, G. Liu, Y. Liu, J. Cao, and Z. Jia, "The effects of emotional labor and competency on job satisfaction in nurses of China: A nationwide cross-sectional survey," International Journal of Nursing Sciences, vol. 5, no. 4, pp. 383-389, 2018.
- [16] S. Ning, H. Zhong, W. Libo, and L. Qiujie, "The impact of nurse empowerment on job satisfaction," Journal of advanced nursing, vol. 65, no. 12, pp. 2642-2648, 2009.
- [17] S. Rajamohan, D. Porock, and Y.-P. Chang, "Understanding the Relationship Between Staff and Job Satisfaction, Stress, Turnover, and Staff Outcomes in the Person-Centered Care Nursing Home Arena," Journal Of Nursing Scholarship, vol. 51, no. 5, pp. 560–568, 2019.
- [18] J. Brook, L. Aitken, R. Webb, J. MacLaren, and D. Salmon, "Characteristics of successful interventions to reduce turnover and increase retention of early career nurses: A systematic review," International Journal Of Nursing Studies, vol. 91, pp. 57–59, 2019.

## International Journal of Interdisciplinary Research and Innovations ISSN 2348-1226 (online) Vol. 9, Issue 2, pp: (134-147), Month: April - June 2021, Available at: www.researchpublish.com

- [19] T. Hoff, S. Carabetta, and G. E. Collinson, "Satisfaction, Burnout, and Turnover Among Nurse Practitioners and Physician Assistants: A Review of the Empirical Literature," Medical Care Research And Review, vol. 76, no. 1, pp. 3–31, 2019.
- [20] F. McDermid, J. Mannix, and K. Peters, "Factors contributing to high turnover rates of emergency nurses: A review of the literature," Australian Critical Care, no. 390–396, 2020.
- [21] R. Falatah and O. A. Salem, "Nurse turnover in the Kingdom of Saudi Arabia: An integrative review," Journal Of Nursing Management, vol. 26, no. 6, pp. 630–638, 2018.
- [22] J. Pedrosa, L. Sousa, O. Valentim, and V. Antunes, "Organizational culture and nurse's turnover: A systematic literature review," International Journal Of Healthcare Management, p. Early Access, 2020.
- [23] Q. Wan, Z. Li, W. Zhou, and S. Shang, "Effects of work environment and job characteristics on the turnover intention of experienced nurses: The mediating role of work engagement," Journal Of Advanced Nursing, vol. 74, no. 6, pp. 1332–1341, Jun. 2018.
- [24] H. Wang, Y. Jin, D. Wang, S. Zhao, X. Sang, and B. Yuan, "Job satisfaction, burnout, and turnover intention among primary care providers in rural China: results from structural equation modeling," BMC Family Practice, vol. 21, no. 1, 2020.
- [25] Fernet, S.-G. Trepanier, M. Demers, and S. Austin, "Motivational pathways of occupational and organizational turnover intention among newly registered nurses in Canada," Nursing Outlook, vol. 65, no. 4, pp. 444–454, 2017.
- [26] Gebregziabher, E. Berhanie, H. Berihu, A. Belstie, and G. Teklay, "The relationship between job satisfaction and turnover intention among nurses in Axum comprehensive and specialized hospital Tigray, Ethiopia," BMC Nursing, vol. 19, no. 1, 2020.
- [27] N. Coudounaris, I. N. Akuffo, and A. O. Nkulenu, "Human Resource Management for Ghanaian Nurses: Job Satisfaction Versus Turnover Intentions," Sustainability, vol. 12, no. 17, 2020.
- [28] L. Ran, X. Chen, S. Peng, F. Zheng, X. Tan, and R. Duan, "Job burnout and turnover intention among Chinese primary healthcare staff: the mediating effect of satisfaction," BMJ Open, vol. 10, no. 10, 2020.
- [29] Rindu, S. Lukman, H. Dasman, Hafizurrahman, and A. Bachtiar, "Turnover Intention Factors among Private Hospital Nurses in Indonesia," Journal Of Clinical And Diagnostic Research, vol. 14, no. 7, pp. IC01 IC04, 2020.
- [30] L. J. Labrague, D. M. McEnroe-Petitte, K. Tsaras, J. P. Cruz, P. C. Colet, and D. S. Gloe, "Organizational commitment and turnover intention among rural nurses in the Philippines: Implications for nursing management," International Journal Of Nursing Sciences, vol. 5, no. 4, pp. 403–408, 2018.
- [31] H. Chen, L. Guohong, L. Mengting, L. Lei, and Z. Tiantian, "A cross-sectional study on nurse turnover intention and influencing factors in Jiangsu Province, China," International Journal of Nursing Sciences, vol. 5, no. 4, pp. 396– 402, 2018.
- [32] H. Wang, Y. Jin, D. Wang, S. Zhao, X. Sang, and B. Yuan, "Job satisfaction, burnout, and turnover intention among primary care providers in rural China: results from structural equation modeling," BMC Family Practice, vol. 21, no. 1, p. 12, 2020.
- [33] V. Ramoo, K. Abdullah, and C. Piaw, "The relationship between job satisfaction and intention to leave current employment among registered nurses in a teaching hospital," Journal of Clinical Nursing, vol. 22, pp. 3141–3152, 2013.
- [34] W. Liu, S. Zhao, L. Shi, Z. Zhang, X. Liu, L. Li, X. Duan, G. Li, F. Lou, X. Jia, L. Fan, T. Sun, and X. Ni, "Workplace violence, job satisfaction, burnout, perceived organisational support and their effects on turnover intention among Chinese nurses in tertiary hospitals: a cross-sectional study," BMJ OPEN, vol. 8, no. 6, Jun. 2018.
- [35] D. Lyu, L. Ji, Q. Zheng, B. Yu, and Y. Fan, "Abusive supervision and turnover intention: Mediating effects of psychological empowerment of nurses," International Journal Of Nursing Sciences, vol. 6, no. 2, pp. 198–203, 2019.

## International Journal of Interdisciplinary Research and Innovations ISSN 2348-1226 (online) Vol. 9, Issue 2, pp: (134-147), Month: April - June 2021, Available at: www.researchpublish.com

- [36] C. M. Lee, H. ok So, and E. Ko, "Influences of Occupational Stress, Ethical Dilemma, and Burnout on Turnover Intention in Hospital Nurses," The Journal of Fundamentals of Nursing, vol. 26, no. 1, pp. 42–51, 2019.
- [37] J. S. Choi and K. M. Kim, "Effects of nursing organizational culture and job stress on Korean infection control nurses' turnover intention," American Journal Of Infection Control, vol. 48, no. 11, pp. 1404–1406, 2020.
- [38] H. Yang, J. Lv, X. Zhou, H. Liu, and B. Mi, "Validation of work pressure and associated factors influencing hospital nurse turnover: a cross-sectional investigation in Shaanxi Province, China," BMC Health Services Research, vol. 17, 2017.
- [39] B. I. J. M. Van der Heijden, M. C. W. Peeters, P. M. Le Blanc, and J. W. M. Van Breukelen, "Job characteristics and experience as predictors of occupational turnover intention and occupational turnover in the European nursing sector," Journal Of Vocational Behavior, vol. 108, no. 108, p. 120, 2018.
- [40] D. Chênevert, G. Jourdain, and C. Vandenberghe, "The role of high-involvement work practices and professional self-image in nursing recruits' turnover: A three-year prospective study," International Journal of Nursing Studies, vol. 53, pp. 73–84, 2016.
- [41] A. A. da Silva, M. Nora, and M. Z. de Oliveira, "The Predictive Function of Burnout Syndrome for Turnover in Staff Nursing," Avances En Psicologia Latinoamericana, vol. 35, no. 3, pp. 433–445, 2017.
- [42] Z. Yuanyuan, S. Linsey M., P. Katie U., B. Roger L., and Z. Yaqing, "Identifying patterns of occupational stress trajectories among newly graduated nurses: A longitudinal study," International Journal of Nursing Studies, vol. 99, p. 103332, 2019.
- [43] K. Emmanuel and S. Mohammed A., "Effect of Workload on Job Stress of Ghanaian OPD Nurses: The Role of Coworker Support," Safety and Health at Work, vol. 10, no. 3, pp. 341–346, 2019.
- [44] L. J. Hayes, L. O'Brien-Pallas, C. Duffield, J. Shamian, J. Buchan, F. Hughes, H. K. S. Laschinger, and N. North, "Nurse turnover: A literature review - An update," International Journal Of Nursing Studies, vol. 49, no. 7, pp. 887–905, Jul. 2012.
- [45] B. Hayes, C. Douglas, and A. Bonner, "Work environment, job satisfaction, stress and burnout among haemodialysis nurses," Journal of nursing management, vol. 23, no. 5, pp. 588–598, 2015.
- [46] Y. Zeki, A. Sevgi, and E. Şenol, "The impact of nurses' motivation to work, job satisfaction, and sociodemographic characteristics on intention to quit their current job: An empirical study in Turkey," Applied Nursing Research, vol. 22, no. 2, pp. 113–118, 2009.
- [47] A. Dewanto and V. Wardhani, "Nurse turnover and perceived causes and consequences: a preliminary study at private hospitals in Indonesia," BMC nursing, vol. 17, no. Suppl 2, p. 52, 2018.
- [48] H.-Y. Chang, D. Friesner, T.-L. Chu, T.-L. Huang, Y.-N. Liao, and C.-I. Teng, "The impact of burnout on self-efficacy, outcome expectations, career interest and nurse turnover," Journal Of Advanced Nursing, vol. 74, no. 11, pp. 2555–2565, 2018.
- [49] L. C. Lindley and M. J. Cozad, "Nurse Knowledge, Work Environment, and Turnover in Highly Specialized Pediatric End-of-Life Care," American Journal Of Hospice & Palliative Medicine, vol. 34, no. 6, pp. 577–583, 2017.
- [50] J. Ki, J. Ryu, J. Baek, I. Huh, and S. Choi-Kwon, "Association between Health Problems and Turnover Intention in Shift Work Nurses: Health Problem Clustering," International Journal Of Environmental Research And Public Health, vol. 17, no. 12, 2020.
- [51] J. Rezaei, S. Naderi, E. Mahmoudi, S. Rezaei, and A. Hashemian, "Job Burnout Rate and Related Demographic Factors in Nursing Personnel Employed in Emergency Departments of Chosen Educational Hospitals by Kermanshah University of Medical Science in 2012," Advances in Biological Research, vol. 9, pp. 117–127, 2015.

# International Journal of Interdisciplinary Research and Innovations ISSN 2348-1226 (online) Vol. 9, Issue 2, pp: (134-147), Month: April - June 2021, Available at: <a href="https://www.researchpublish.com">www.researchpublish.com</a>

- [52] H.-J. Kang, J. Shin, and E.-H. Lee, "Relationship of Workplace Violence to Turnover Intention in Hospital Nurses: Resilience as a Mediator," Journal of Korean Academy of Nurse, vol. 50, no. 5, pp. 728–736, 2020.
- [53] L. Qi, X. Wei, Y. Li, B. Liu, and Z. Xu, "The Influence of Mistreatment by Patients on Job Satisfaction and Turnover Intention among Chinese Nurses: A Three-Wave Survey," International Journal Of Environmental Research And Public Health, vol. 17, no. 4, Feb. 2020.
- [54] S. Y. Beak and S. J. Kang, "Pediatric Nurses' Perceptions related to End-of-Life Care and Turnover Intention," Child Health Nursing Research, vol. 24, no. 4, pp. 353–363, 2018.
- [55] T. Salehi, M. Barzegar, M. S. Yekaninejad, and H. Ranjbar, "Relationship between Healthy Work Environment, Job Satisfaction and Anticipated Turnover among Nurses in Intensive Care unit (ICUs)," Annals Of Medical And Health Sciences Research, vol. 10, no. 2, pp. 826–831, 2020.