

ENHANCED GRAPHIC-BASED READING MATERIALS IN MOTHER TONGUE TOWARDS COMPREHENSION

Gina W. Ebisa

Ed.D.

¹Department of Education, Carcar City Division

¹P. Nellas St. Poblacion III, Carcar City, Cebu, Philippines

Abstract: This study assessed the effects of the developed multimedia-based materials in Mother Tongue towards comprehension of Grade one learners in identified Medium Schools at Carcar City Division, Carcar City, Cebu during the School Year 2019-2020. This study made use of the quasi-experimental method with the pre-post test results using the Early Grade Reading Assessment adapted from Carcar City Division before and after exposure to graphic-based materials. The frequency and simple percentage, z-test and T-test Mean Difference were used for the treatment of data. The finding reveals that there is a significant improvement of the reading comprehension after employing the intervention of the enhanced graphic-based reading materials. The use of the enhanced graphic-based materials enabled pupils to achieve better reading performance and the use of graphic based was very motivating and beneficial since graphic based did not only enhance the pupils reading level but also improve and develop their reading comprehension as well.

Keywords: Teaching Reading, Graphic- Based Reading, Quasi-Experimental, Grade One Learners, Carcar City, Cebu, Philippines.

I. INTRODUCTION

In the 21st century, reading is considered as an important skill to help people learn from human knowledge through experience. Through reading, knowledge has greatly contributed to the growth of mankind throughout the world. In fact, it plays a huge role for the development of the country. In teaching Reading for beginners, teachers must keep the learners at their best and give emphasis on the development of their skills in order to sustain a learning environment that creates continuous improvement.

Teachers should do innovations in to cater to the needs of the learners in the process of learning. One of the issues of the primary school learners across the world is their poor reading performance after the early years of schooling. Despite of the modern advances in information technology and the development of a range of communication tools in the advanced world, learning to read remain important (Anstey and Bull, 2004).

According to Laskowski (2001), effective reading increases both the self-esteem and the chances for individual development. He explains that everyone should know reading and proper communications. He added that is important factor in the workplace as means of communication and understanding.

Teaching reading may be affected by teacher's attitude towards the effectiveness of interventions in reading. Globally, research supports the notion that perceptions and attitudes that teachers have about teaching early reading can have an influence on their classroom practices (Powers, Zippay, and Butler, 2006).

One particular example on the poor reading performance of the learners is the low reading levels of Turkish students. Because of this academic failure of Turkish students in international examinations, the Turkish Education System has been revised and improved in order to nurture students reading skills in the elementary and high school. The curricula have been renewed under the light of international educational progress in order to develop students' academic skills in reading as revealed by the International Journal on New Trends in Education and Their Implications, 2012.

Hall, Hughes, and Filbert (2009) revealed that with regards to low performing reading, they continually failed to learn in the content areas due to poor reading comprehension. Those teachers who know that their learners are having a hard time in reading and are showing importance about these are those kinds of teachers who are willing to find strategies and techniques for them to cater on the needs of their learners. If teachers do not show willingness in helping the learners who are struggling in reading, then there will be less chances for them to acquire the specified strategies that could help them. The solution for learners who are struggling in reading may concretely start on the teachers' notion towards the issue (Hoffman et.al' 2005)

In teaching reading, teachers must keep the learners at their best, give emphasis on the development of their skills in order to sustain a learning environment that creates continuous improvement. Teachers must do innovations in order to cater to the needs of the learners in acquiring the skills in reading. The acquisition of the skills must not merely stick to the mind but is useful and applicable in varied instances. There are different strategies, techniques, and interventions in developing the skills of the pupils in reading. But on the other hand, it must be kept in mind that every teaching technique varies depending on the skill to be taught. There is a teaching technique that is effective in teaching a skill but not effective to another skills. However, considerations of the acquired skills, experiences, and the learning environment that the learners are exposed to must be noted. That is why the researcher wants to prove that using multimedia reading materials in teaching reading for Grade one pupils is a great help for them.

According to Zaitoun (2002), multimedia makes the reading process adynamic one instead of the written presentation of the text printed in the book. Through the presentation of the different drawings and pictures, it will support and clarify ideas and communication of information. It provides a good chance for questions and discussions that would develop their comprehension skills. Using useful different presentations like video clips along with maps or other kinds of presentations will help to get the information closer to reality. Adding music makes the idea clearer and it attracts the attention of the learners.

Based on the researcher's observation of the reading level of the grade one pupils in some schools of Carcar City Division, results indicated that they are very poor in reading and answering comprehension questions. It is a great challenge to the teachers in the school in improving the reading levels of their learners. It is one of the issues of the school which needs to be addressed. Oyangoren (2013), once cited in her study that most pupils who have difficulty in reading are also at risk in academic achievement. The first year of schooling of the children is essential especially in terms of phonetic awareness. Griffeth (2000) cited by Mier (2012) that poor readers who enter the first grade phonetically unaware are likely to remain at the end of the fourth grade due to lack of phonetic awareness which contributes to their slow acquisition of word recognition skills.

It is in this premise that the researcher is determined to conduct the study to assess the reading level of the grade one pupils using graphic based reading materials which is very critical for the improvement of the reading level of the learners. With this, it will improve the reading capabilities of the pupils towards their comprehension skills as basis for the enhanced graphic-based reading materials.

In the 21st century, reading is considered as an important skill to help people learn from human knowledge through experience. Through reading, knowledge has greatly contributed to the growth of mankind throughout the world. In fact, it plays a huge role for the development of the country. In teaching Reading for beginners, teachers must keep the learners at their best and give emphasis on the development of their skills in order to sustain a learning environment that creates continuous improvement.

Teachers should do innovations in to cater to the needs of the learners in the process of learning. One of the issues of the primary school learners across the world is their poor reading performance after the early years of schooling. Despite of the modern advances in information technology and the development of a range of communication tools in the advanced world, learning to read remains important (Anstey and Bull, 2004).

According to Laskowski (2001), effective reading increases both the self-esteem and the chances for individual development. He explains that everyone should know reading and proper communications. He added that is important factor in the workplace as means of communication and understanding.

Teaching reading may be affected by teacher's attitude towards the effectiveness of interventions in reading. Globally, research supports the notion that perceptions and attitudes that teachers have about teaching early reading can have an influence on their classroom practices (Powers, Zippay, and Butler, 2006).

One particular example on the poor reading performance of the learners is the low reading levels of Turkish students. Because of this academic failure of Turkish students in international examinations, the Turkish Education System has been revised and improved in order to nurture students reading skills in the elementary and high school. The curricula have been renewed under the light of international educational progress in order to develop students' academic skills in reading as revealed by the International Journal on New Trends in Education and Their Implications, 2012. Hall, Hughes, and Filbert (2009) revealed that with regards to low performing reading, they continually failed to learn in the content areas due to poor reading comprehension. Those teachers who know that their learners are having a hard time in reading and are showing importance about these are those kinds of teachers who are willing to find strategies and techniques for them to cater on the needs of their learners. If teachers do not show willingness in helping the learners who are struggling in reading, then there will be less chances for them to acquire the specified strategies that could help them. The solution for learners who are struggling in reading may concretely start on the teachers' notion towards the issue (Hoffman et.al' 2005)

In teaching reading, teachers must keep the learners at their best, give emphasis on the development of their skills in order to sustain a learning environment that creates continuous improvement. Teachers must do innovations in order to cater to the needs of the learners in acquiring the skills in reading. The acquisition of the skills must not merely stick to the mind but is useful and applicable in varied instances. There are different strategies, techniques, and interventions in developing the skills of the pupils in reading. But on the other hand, it must be kept in mind that every teaching technique varies depending on the skill to be taught. There is a teaching technique that is effective in teaching a skill but not effective to another skills. However, considerations of the acquired skills, experiences, and the learning environment that the learners are exposed to must be noted. That is why the researcher wants to prove that using multimedia reading materials in teaching reading for Grade one pupils is a great help for them.

According to Zaitoun (2002), multimedia makes the reading process adynamic one instead of the written presentation of the text printed in the book. Through the presentation of the different drawings and pictures, it will support and clarify ideas and communication of information. It provides a good chance for questions and discussions that would develop their comprehension skills. Using useful different presentations like video clips along with maps or other kinds of presentations will help to get the information closer to reality. Adding music makes the idea clearer and it attracts the attention of the learners.

Based on the researcher's observation of the reading level of the grade one pupils in some schools of Carcar City Division, results indicated that they are very poor in reading and answering comprehension questions. It is a great challenge to the teachers in the school in improving the reading levels of their learners. It is one of the issues of the school which needs to be addressed. Oyangoren (2013), once cited in her study that most pupils who have difficulty in reading are also at risk in academic achievement. The first year of schooling of the children is essential especially in terms of phonetic awareness. Griffeth (2000) cited by Mier (2012) that poor readers who enter the first grade phonetically unaware are likely to remain at the end of the fourth grade due to lack of phonetic awareness which contributes to their slow acquisition of word recognition skills.

It is in this premise that the researcher is determined to conduct the study to assess the reading level of the grade one pupils using graphic based reading materials which is very critical for the improvement of the reading level of the learners. With this, it will improve the reading capabilities of the pupils towards their comprehension skills as basis for the enhanced graphic-based reading materials.

Statement of the Problem

This study assessed the effects of the developed digitized graphic-based reading materials for competence of Grade one learners in identified Medium Schools at Carcar City Division, Carcar City, Cebu during the School Year 2019-2020 as basis for Developmental Plan for Reading Instruction.

Specifically, this sought to answer the following sub-problems:

1. What is the pre-test reading level of Grade 1 learners as to the following skills:
 - 1.1 read familiar words;
 - 1.2 read oral passage; and
 - 1.3 answer comprehension questions?
2. After using graphic based materials, what is the post-test reading level of Grade 1 learners in the aforementioned skills?
 - 2.1 read familiar words;
 - 2.2 read oral passage; and
 - 2.3 answer comprehension questions?
3. Is there a significant mean difference in the reading level of learners before and after using graphic based reading materials?
4. Based on the findings, what digitized graphic-based reading materials can be crafted?

II. RESEARCH METHODOLOGY

A. Design

This study utilized the quasi-experimental method with the pre-post test design. This helped to determine the reading level of the Grade one pupils before and after exposure to graphic-based reading materials. According to Creswell (2011) that quasi-experiment is experimental situations in which the researcher assigns, but not randomly, participants to groups because the experimenter cannot artificially create groups for the experiment. Furthermore, the researcher will apply the pre- and posttest design. Creswell explains that a pre-test provides a measure on some attributes or characteristics that will be assessed for participants in an experiment before they receive a treatment. Meanwhile, a posttest is a measure on some attributes or characteristic that will be assessed for participants in an experiment after a treatment. The respondents were given pre-test using the instrument adapted from Early Grade Reading Assessment (EGRA) given by the Carcar City Division in Grade one. The Grade one reading level particularly on the skills that were least mastered in reading whether there was improvement or not. After the pre-test, the same group of pupils were given intervention. They practiced reading through their television or laptop for one and a half hour a day and after two months exposure to graphic-based reading materials post-test was given. The pre-test and post-test scores were used as statistical control in the analysis and in analyzing gain scores. The success of the treatment was determined by comparing the pre-test and post-test scores of the pupils.

B. Respondents

The respondents of this study were some of the grade one learners of some schools of Carcar City Division, Carcar City, Cebu during the School Year 2019-2020. The learners were determined through cluster sampling technique. Each cluster is composed of 38 Grade one learners. The inclusion criteria were based on their age, reading ability, socio-economic status and regardless of gender. Each cluster had the same characteristics.

C. Instrument

The study utilized an adapted research instruments from Carcar City Division on Early Grade Reading Assessment. This instrument was divided into two parts: Part A contained the profile of the respondents as to age, gender, and dialect spoken at home and availability of the multimedia resources at home. Part was divided in three parts as to read familiar words, read oral passage and answer comprehension questions. In reading familiar words there were 50 words and reading oral passage there were 60 words where the pupils were only allowed to read within one minute. There were six (6) questions answered based only to where he/she stopped during the oral passage reading. The pupils were oriented on how to accomplish the tool. The items were discussed and explained properly to the learners. Then the test was administered again after being exposed to graphic-based reading materials. In addition, the Graphic Based Reading Materials served as the treatment of the investigation of the pupils in acquiring the skills in reading.

D. Data Analysis

The study utilized the various statistical computations to analyze and interpret the data collected. These were:

Frequency and Simple Percentage for the profile of respondents as to age, and gender.

Z-Test was used to determine the pre-test and post-test score distribution on the reading levels as to read familiar words, read oral passage and answer comprehension questions based on the oral passage.

T-Test Mean Difference was used to determine whether there is a significant mean difference between the pre-test and post-test on early grade reading assessment of the grade one pupils.

III. RESULTS AND DISCUSSION

Pre-Test Reading Level of The Respondents as to Read Familiar Words

The pre-test reading level of the learner respondents as to real familiar words was determined through the Oral Verification Reading of the three (3) medium schools. The result is presented in Table 1.

TABLE I: PRE-TEST READING LEVEL OF THE RESPONDENTS AS TO READ FAMILIAR WORDS

Read Familiar Words Schools	Above Average (39-50)		Average(20-38)		Below Average(19 and below)		TOTAL	
	f	%	f	%	f	%	f	%
Tuyom E/S	3	2.86	18	17.14	17	16.19	38	36.19
Valladolid E/S	3	2.86	8	7.62	19	18.10	30	28.57
Tawog E/S	3	2.86	15	14.29	19	18.10	37	35.24
TOTAL	9	8.57	41	39.05	55	52.38	105	100

As reflected in the Table 1, nine (9) or 8.57% of the respondents fell under **above average level**, 41 or 39.05% were under **average level** and 55 or 52.38% were at the **below average level**. This means that most of the respondents really find difficulty in reading familiar words. This finding agrees also of the study conducted by Dianne (2009) that teachers should consider learners ability to comprehend words and sentences and learning style in making remediation.

Pre-Test Reading Level of the Respondents as to Read Oral Passage

The pre-test reading level of the learner respondents as to read oral passage was determined through the Oral Verification Reading of the three (3) medium schools. This is presented in Table 2.

TABLE II: PRE-TEST READING LEVEL OF THE RESPONDENTS AS TO READ ORAL PASSAGE

Read Oral Passage Schools	Above Average (46-60)		Average (25-45)		Below Average (24 and below)		TOTAL	
	f	%	f	%	f	%	f	%
Tuyom E/S	0	0	16	15.24	22	20.95	38	36.19
Valladolid E/S	1	.95	7	6.67	22	20.95	30	28.57
Tawog E/S	1	.95	13	12.38	23	21.90	37	35.24
TOTAL	2	1.9	36	34.29	67	63.81	105	100

As shown in Table 2, two (2) or 1.9% of the respondents fell under **above average level**, 36 or 34.29% were at the **average level** and 67 or 63.81% were at **below average level**. As you can see in the table, out of 105 respondents 67 of them fell from below average. This implies that pupils need constant guidance of the teachers in the area of reading oral passage since it was evident that pupils have poor performance in reading oral passage. This finding is in line with Oyangoren (2013), that most pupils who have difficulty in reading are also at risk in academic achievement.

Pre-Test Reading Level of the Respondents as to Answering Comprehension Questions

The pre-test reading level of the learner respondents as to answering comprehension was determined through the Oral Verification Reading of the three (3) medium schools. The result is presented in Table 3.

TABLE III: PRE-TEST READING LEVEL OF THE RESPONDENTS AS TO ANSWERING COMPREHENSION QUESTIONS

Answer Comprehension Questions Schools	Above Average (5-6)		Average (3-4)		Below Average (2 and below)		TOTAL	
	f	%	f	%	f	%	f	%
Tuyom E/S	0	0	6	5.71	32	30.48	38	36.19
Valladolid E/S	0	0	9	8.57	21	20	30	28.57
Tawog E/S	0	0	3	2.86	34	32.38	37	35.24
TOTAL	0	0	18	17.14	87	82.86	105	100

As gleaned in Table 3, none of the respondents falls under above average while 18 or 17.14% got the score of 3-4 and most of them had the score of 2 and below. It is evident that out 105 respondents 87 fell under below average and were not able to reach performance target in comprehension because they were not speedy in reading the story in the oral passage and understand well in the story. The finding agrees on the study conducted by Rubin, as cited by Arandia (2003) also stated that at the more intelligent the individual, the more he is able to comprehend to the questions being asked reading passage.

Post-Test Reading Level of the Respondents as to Read Familiar Words

The post-test reading level of the learner respondents as to read familiar was determined through the Oral Verification Reading of the three (3) medium schools. The result is presented in Table 4.

TABLE IV: POST-TEST READING LEVEL OF THE RESPONDENTS AS TO READ FAMILIAR WORDS

Read Familiar Words Schools	Above Average (39-50)		Average (20-38)		Below Average (19 and below)		TOTAL	
	F	%	f	%	f	%	f	%
Tuyom E/S	14	13.33	15	14.29	9	8.57	38	36.19
Valladolid E/S	10	9.52	11	10.48	9	8.57	30	28.57
Tawog E/S	13	12.38	16	15.24	8	7.62	37	35.24
TOTAL	37	35.24	42	40	26	24.76	105	100

As gleaned in Table 4, 37 or 35.24% fell under **above average level**, 42 or 40.00% were at the **average level** and 26 or 24.76% were **below average**. As you can see that there is an improvement of the performance of the respondents as to read familiar words in the post-test after being exposed to the graphic based reading materials for one and a half hour a day in week for two months. This finding agrees the findings of the study by Cueca (2008), the comprehension of the learners depends on how the teachers integrate the learning with the used of varied multimedia and constant supervision.

Post-Test Reading Level of the Respondents as to Read Oral Passage

The post-test reading level of the learner respondents as to read oral passage was determined through the Oral Verification Reading of the three (3) medium schools. The result is presented in Table 5.

TABLE V: POST-TEST READING LEVEL OF THE RESPONDENTS AS TO READ ORAL PASSAGE

Read Oral Passage Schools	Above Average (46-60)		Average (25-45)		Below Average (24 and below)		TOTAL	
	f	%	f	%	f	%	f	%
Tuyom E/S	9	8.57	17	16.19	12	11.43	38	36.19
Valladolid E/S	7	6.67	12	11.43	11	10.48	30	28.57
Tawog E/S	7	6.67	18	17.14	12	11.43	37	35.24
TOTAL	23	21.90	47	44.76	35	33.33	105	100

As shown in Table 5, there were 23 or 21.90 percent that fell **above average level while** 47 or 44.76% belong to **average level** and still 35 or 33.33% were **below average level**. As you can see that during the pretest 67 respondents fell under below average and after exposure to the graphic based materials, there were only 35 respondents fell under below average. This means that there is a significant improvement of the performance of the respondents in the reading oral passage during the post-test. This implies that the enhanced graphic-based reading material used is a good remediation and intervention for reading comprehension of the learners for one and a half hour a day in week for two months. This finding confirms the study conducted by Cosibolo (2015) that pupils exposed to reading materials have significantly improved the level of reading comprehension. Hence, as also observed by Cuenca (2015), the teacher's determination and extending his/her effort would help motivate learners to improve their performance in the school.

Post-Test Reading Level of the Respondents as to Answer Comprehension Questions

The post-test reading level of the learner respondents as to answering comprehension was determined through the Oral Verification Reading of the three (3) medium schools. The result is presented in Table 6.

TABLE VI: POST TEST READING LEVEL OF THE RESPONDENTS AS TO ANSWER COMPREHENSION QUESTIONS

Answer Comprehension Questions Schools	Above Average (5-6)		Average (3-4)		Below Average (2 and below)		TOTAL	
	f	%	f	%	f	%	F	%
Tuyom E/S	10	9.52	15	14.29	13	12.38	38	36.19
Valladolid E/S	12	11.43	9	8.57	9	8.57	30	28.57
Tawog E/S	8	7.62	14	13.33	15	14.29	37	35.24
TOTAL	30	28.57	38	36.19	37	35.24	105	100

As reflected in Table 6, there were 30 or 28.57% who fell under **above average level**, 38 or 36.19% belongs to **average level** and 37 or 35.24% were at **below average level**. This means that there is also an improvement in the post test performance of the respondents in answering comprehension questions after being exposed to the graphic based reading materials for one and half hour a day in a week for two months. As you can see in the table, only 37 respondents fell under below average level during the post-test out of 87 respondents who fell under below average level during the pretest. This finding confirms to the results of the study conducted by Vera (2014) which stated that learners who were exposed with the multimedia reading materials could have more refined reading comprehension. This was supported by the study of Paradi (2014) which found out that to produce productive learners, one has to be innovative and resourceful in dealing learners as part of the learning and training of the teachers. Teachers take actions even when the problems of the learners become not serious.

Significant Mean Difference in the Reading Level of the Learners before And After Using Graphic-Based Reading Materials

The significant mean difference in the reading level of learners before and after using the graphic-based reading materials was tested at 0.05 level of significance. The result is presented in Table 7.

TABLE VII: SIGNIFICANT MEAN DIFFERENCE IN THE READING LEVEL OF LEARNERS BEFORE AND AFTER USING GRAPHIC-BASED READING MATERIALS

Reading Competencies	Mean		Computed t-value	Critical t-value	Decision	Interpretation
	Before	After				
Read familiar words	Before	21.63	18.61	1.98	Reject Ho	Significant
	After	30.61				
Read oral passage	Before	19.65	20.69	1.98	Reject Ho	Significant
	After	30.90				
Answer comprehension questions	Before	1.77	16.08	1.98	Reject Ho	Significant
	After	3.35				

Table 7 displays the mean difference in the reading level of learners before and after using the graphic-based reading materials. It includes reading familiar words, reading oral passage and answering comprehension questions. It also reflects the mean before and after using the graphic-based reading materials in all the three (3) competencies.

In terms of reading familiar words, the **computed t-value** is **18.61** which is higher than the **critical t-value** of **1.98** which leads to a decision of rejecting the null hypothesis. This means that there is a **significant** difference between the means before and after using the graphic-based reading materials. The mean after is really higher than the mean before using graphic-based reading material. This implies that the use of the graphic-based reading material really enhances the reading skill of the pupils specifically in reading familiar words. Enriquez (2006) cited by Sanchez (2013) in her study, recommended that teachers should broaden their access and try to adopt the increasing demand to revolutionize from the traditional way of teaching to the 21st century way of teaching. The involvement of graphic reading materials is advantageous in the process of developing the skills of the pupils.

In terms of reading oral passage, the **computed t-value** of **20.69** is higher than the **critical t-value** of **1.98** which leads to a decision of rejecting the null hypothesis. This means that there is a **significant** difference between the means before and after using the graphic-based reading materials. The **mean** after is really higher than the mean before using graphic-based reading materials. This implies that the use of graphic-based reading materials really enhances the reading skill of the pupils particularly in reading oral passage. Teachers are required to make critical decisions relevant to teaching strategies that they must use in order to develop the skills in reading which were discussed by Reeves et al, (2010). This finding agrees with the findings of the study conducted by Jamin (2015) which stressed that teachers must be critical in looking at the problems and concerns of their learners in the classroom which also agreed in the study of Lao (2007) on the constant conduct of remediation to the least learners are highly prioritized by the teachers.

In terms of answering comprehension questions, the **computed t-value** of **16.08** is higher than the **critical t-value** of **1.98** which leads to a decision of rejecting the null hypothesis. This means that there is a **significant** difference between the means before and after using the graphic-based reading materials. The mean after is really higher than the mean before using graphic-based reading materials. This implies that the use of graphic-based reading materials really enhanced the reading skill of the pupils particularly in answering comprehension questions. This finding agrees to the findings of the study conducted by Rubin, (2003) which claimed that teachers play an important role to develop a multimedia material that helps improve the reading comprehension of the learners. Hence, as also observe by Arandia (2003), the level of comprehension of the learners depends on how the teacher stresses out the questions.

IV. SUMMARY OF FINDINGS

The following were the major findings obtained after the null hypotheses were tested at the 0.05 level of significance: Out of 105 learner respondents, there were 55 male respondents and 50 female respondents and 8 teacher respondents; most of the respondents were 5-6 year old since it obtained the highest frequency 97 or 92.38 percent and bachelor's degree with MA units who gained the most number of frequency which was 6 with a percentage of 75 on the teachers' respondents highest educational attainment.

Most of the pupils' reading level before using the enhanced graphic-based materials was below average on the three skills such as: read familiar words, read oral passage and answer comprehension questions. After using the enhanced graphic-based materials, most of the below average learners move to average and above average in reading familiar words, in reading oral passage and in answering comprehension questions. In addition, there was a significant difference of the means before and after using the enhanced graphic-based reading materials.

V. CONCLUSION

The problem of the learners in reading comprehension can be eliminated. However, it will take time and determination on the part of teachers. There are many effective teaching approaches that would help learners to become better in reading with the pacing of the teacher. If the enhanced graphic-based materials can be implemented, Educators will surely see a decrease problem in reading comprehension of our learners.

VI. RECOMMENDATIONS

In view of the findings and conclusions presented, the following actions are recommended:

1. Teachers must conduct enhancement exercises especially for slow and non-readers to improve their reading ability.

2. Teachers must utilize the enhanced graphic-based materials in order to improve the least mastered reading skills of the learners. This is one of the needed approaches because of the great diversity of conditions faced by the schools.
3. Primary grade teachers should attend seminar-workshop on how to use the different forms of media. And based on the learning they got from seminars, trainings and the like to facilitate effective delivery of classroom instruction.
4. More challenging activities using graphics should be exposed to students and the construction of communicative exercises using graphic-based materials is highly recommended. With this, direct education in both print and non-print texts would be included and the essence of literacy would be broadened.
5. It is highly recommended that a replication of this study on other schools shall be conducted to provide a more valid result on the effectiveness of the use of the enhanced Graphic-Based Reading Materials not only in Mother tongue but all the rest of the subjects.
6. Furthermore, adoption of the study is recommended, and the output of the study must be utilized.

REFERENCES

- [1] Akram, T. (2010). Reading using module among learners. Boston: Addison-Wisley Educationa Publisher, Inc.
- [2] Anstey, M., & Bull, G. (2004). The Literacy Labyrinth. (2nd ed.). Frenchs Forest, New South Wales: Pearson Education Australia.
- [3] Barameda, C. N. (2010). Transactional and comprehension for development Metro Manila: Philippine University.
- [4] Barone, D., Hardman, D., & Taylor, J. (2010). Reading First in the classroom. Boston, MA: Pearson.
- [5] Biggs, 2003; Judson, 2006. Aligning teaching for constructing learning. Boston: Ma: Pearson.
- [6] Calapre, R. (2009). Educational research on teaching. Ohio: Charles E. Merrill Publishing Company.
- [7] Cabidog, L. (2009). A teaching aid in education. Quezon City: Gentess Printing Press, Inc.
- [8] Castillo, E., Mosquera, D., & Palacios, D. (2008). Concept maps: A tool to enhance reading comprehension skills of children with hearing impairments.
- [9] Chomphuchart, E. (2006). Research and Teaching. Chicago, Illinois: Lyceum Book.
- [10] Costibolo, R. (2015). Factors affecting the reading styles of the pupils. Malabon City: Kerusso Printing Press.
- [11] Cueca, J. (2008). Mixed methods and approaches to learning. Thousand Oaks, CA: Sage Publication.
- [12] D' Archangelo, (2003). Educational Psychology. MC-Graw Hill Publishing House Incorporated.
- [13] Dani D E, Koenig Km, (2008) New Media and Education in the 21st Century
- [14] Denton, E. et al., (2015). ESL learner's use of reading strategies. Thousand Oaks, CA: Sage Publications.
- [15] Dobler, M. (2007). Becoming a beginning teacher: A guide for learning approach. New York: Guilford Press.
- [16] Gutierrez, D. S. (2007), Assessment of learning outcomes (Cognitive level) Book 1. Malabon City: Kerusso Printing Press.
- [17] Laskowski, R. (2001). Innovation techniques in reading. Texas: Laureate Publishing.
- [18] Paradi, B. (2014). Using media in handling classes. California: Lippincott William & Wilkins.
- [19] Mayer, R. E. (2005). The Cambridge handbook of multimedia learning. New York, NY: Cambridge University Press.
- [20] Nassji, R. (2002). Educational research: Quantitative approach. Oaks, CA: Sage Publications.
- [21] Piaget, Jean 2007. The Modern Psychology. New York: Mc Graw Hill k, Publishing House incorporated.
- [22] Pikulski, J. J., & Chard, D. J. (2005). Fluency: Bridge Between Decoding and Reading Comprehension. The Reading Teacher, 58, 510-519.

- [23] Powers, S.W., Zippay, C., & Butler, B (2006). Investigating connections between teachers' beliefs and instructional practices with struggling readers. *Reading Horizons Journal*, 47(2),121-157.
- [24] Richard, C. (2005). *Classroom instructions for learning*. Philadelphia: Saunders.
- [25] Rubinson, M. (2016). *Factors affecting learning*. Balanga City: Asia Pacific College of Advance Studies.
- [26] Seedhouse, P., 2004. *The Interactional Architecture of the language classroom: a conversation analysis perspective*. USA: Blackwell Publishing
- [27] Vera, T. (2014). *Reading effectiveness*. (Rev.ed).Quezon City: Rex Publishing House, Inc.
- [28] Villamor, H. S. (2015). *Learning modules among learners*. Angeles City: Holy Angel University.
- [29] Zhang, H. (2008). *A handbook for interview for learning*. New York: Springer.

UNPUBLISHED THESES/DISSERTATION

- [30] Alberca, Mary Ann P. 2018. *Enhancing School Reading Instruction Program*, Unpublished Doctor's Dissertation, Cebu Technological University, Argao Campus.
- [31] Dungog, Ruth. (2010). *Remedial, intervention and enhancement in teaching english*. Unpublished Thesis. Tacloban City: Asian Development Foundation, Inc.
- [32] Escudro, Sarah A 2010." *Effectiveness of DEPED'S EIGHT-WEEK CURRICULUM ON THE READINESS OF GRADE 1 LEARNERS*" Unpublished Master's Thesis. Cebu Normal University.
- [33] Guiao, B. (2005). *Revisit of St. John Academy philosophy vis-a-vis academic performance*. Unpublished Thesis. Angeles, Pampanga: Holy Angel University.
- [34] Labro, R. (2009). *Elementary classroom climate: Basis for learning improvement*. Unpublished Thesis. San Jose City. Core Gateway College.
- [35] Lao, M. M. (2007). *Managerial skills and difficulties of elementary teachers*. Unpublished Thesis. Nueva Ecija: Dr.Gloria D. Lacson Foundation College, Inc.
- [36] Mier, Maribeth A. 2015. *Linguistic Competence and Learning Styles among Grade Six Pupils of Multigrader Schools of Argao 1 District*, Unpublished Doctor's Dissertation, Cebu Technological University
- [37] Mier, Maribeth A. 2012. *English Achievement of the Grade Four Pupils of Bojo Elementary School, Aloguinsan: PROPOSED Learning Exercises*, Unpublished Master's Thesis, Cebu Technological University.
- [38] Oyangoren, Analyn A. (2013). *Enhanced Remedial Reading Instructions for Early Grade One Reading Readiness Assessment Of Bogo Elementary School*, Unpublished Master's Thesis, Cebu Technological University.
- [39] Pntilgan, Romelito. (2019). *Modular Approach in Teaching Chemical Elements and Compounds*. Unpublished Thesis, Negros Oriental State University.
- [40] Pansit, Mary ann C. 2016. *Enhanced MTB Strategic Intervention Materials For Reading*, Unpublished Master's Thesis, Cebu Technological University.
- [41] Ranara, Grace 2003. *Philippine Informal Reading Inventory of the Grade 1 Pupils of Tajao Elementary School; Proposed Remedial Instruction*, Unpublished Master's Thesis, Cebu Normal University.
- [42] Rubin, Arnold 2003. *Remedial Instruction for the preschoolers of Cebu Normal University*. Unpublished Master's Thesis.
- [43] Sanchez, Jovencia C. 2013. *Enhanced Strategic Intervention Materials SIMs in Science Teaching*, Unpublished Master's Thesis, Cebu Technological University.

JOURNALS

- [44] Afflerbach, T. et al., (2008). *Physiological techniques for teachers in reading techniques*. *Quantitative Report*, 15 (4), 201-207.

- [45] Gray, A. L., & McCutchen, D. (2006). Children's Morphological Knowledge: Link to literacy. *Reading Psychology: An International Journal*, 29, 289-314.
- [46] *International Journal on New Trends in Education and Their Implications*, 2012.
- [47] Lutz, S., & Huitt, W. (2004). Connecting Cognitive Development and Constructivism: Implications from theory for instruction and assessment. *Constructivism in the Human Sciences*, 9(1), 67-90.
- [48] A & Ferrer, M. F. (2013). A Qualitative Analysis of the Decoding Error Patterns Among Filipino Beginning Readers: *International Journal of Research Studies in Bustos-Orosa*, M. A. & Ferrer, M. F. 48 Consortia Academia Publishing.
- [49] Shanahan, T. (2006). *The national reading panel report: Practical advice for teachers* Naperville, IL: Learning Point Associates.
- [50] Benner, J., Beaudion, K., Kinder, D., & P. Mooney (2008). The relationship between the beginning reading skills and social adjustment of a general sample of elementary aged children *Education and Treatment of Children*, 28(3), 250-264.
- [51] Sun, T. (2003). The interactive relational approach. *The Asia Pacific Education Researchers*, (24)6, 338-342.

ELECTRONIC SOURCES

- [52] Casan, J. (2018). Marungko Approach: A Tool to Enhance the Reading Skills of Kindergarten Pupils. Retrieved from: https://www.academia.edu/37732798/_Marungko_Approach_A_Tool_to_Enhance_The_Reading_Skills_of_Kindergarten_Pupils/ on April 3, 2020
- [53] Kini, T. & Podolsky, A. (2016). Teaching experience and teaching effectiveness. Retrieved from the website <https://www.aft.org/ae/fall2016/notebook> on April 2 2020.
- [54] Pajares, F., & Schunk, D. (2006). Self-beliefs and school's success: Self-efficacy, self-concept, and school achievement. In R. Riding & S. Rayner (Eds), *Perception* (pp. 239-266). London: Ablex Publishing. Retrieved October 2009, from <http://www.des.emory.edu/mfp/PajaresSchunk2001.html>
- [55] Quilla, R. (2018). The Effectiveness of Marungko Approach on the Reading Performance of Kindergarten Learners in Filipino. Retrieved from www.msugensangradthesis.com/2018/06/09/the-effectiveness-of-marungko-approach-on-the-reading-performance-of-kindergarten-learners/ on April 3, 2020.
- [56] Twist, L., Sainsbury, M., Woodthorpe, A. and Whetton, C (2009). *Reading All Over the World: the PIRLS National Report*: NFER. <http://nferreport.html>.